

WOLKITE UNIVERSITY



SCHOOL OF LAW

WITNESS PROTECTION UNDER THE ETHIOPIAN LEGAL SYSTEM

THESIS SUBMITTED TO THE PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE
BACHELOR OF LAW (LL.B.)

PREPARED BY DEJENE KUMSAA..... ID NO
SLR/018/11 E.C

ADVISOR MR, MARGA FEKADU (LLB.LLM)

February,2023

Wolkite, Ethiopia

Table of Contents

DECLARATION	I
ACKNOWLEDGMENT.....	II
ACRONYMS	III
ABSTRACTS	IV
CHAPTER ONE	1
INTRODUCTION	1
1.1, Back ground of the study	1
1.2 .Statement of the problem	2
1.3. Literature review	3
1.4. Objective of the study	4
1.4.1. General objective	4
1.4.2. Specific objective.....	4
1.5. Research question	4
The research ais to address the following questions	4
1.6. Scope of the study (research).....	5
1.7. Significance of the study.....	5
1.8. Methodology	5
1.8.1. Research design.....	5
1.8.2. Data sources	5
1.9. Limitation of the study.....	6
1.9.1. Organization of the study.....	6
CHAPTER TWO	7
CONCEPTUAL FOUNDATION OF WITNESS PROTECTION	7
2.1 witness protection an overview.....	7
2.1.1. Witness and witness protection program defined	9
2.2 International developments on witness protection.....	10
2.3. Witness protection, Brief history	12
2.4. Witness protection in certain countries.....	13
2.4.1. Witness protection in South Africa.....	13

2.4.2. Witness protection program in Germany	14
2.4.3. Witness protection in Italy	15
2.4.4. Witness protection in Australia.....	17
2.4.5. Witness protection in Colombia.....	19
CHAPTER THREE	20
WITNESS PROTECTION UNDER ETHIOPIAN LEGAL SYTEM	20
3.1. General introduction.....	20
3.2. Witness protection under FDRE constitution	21
3.3. Witness protection under the criminal code of FDRE	22
3.4. Witness protection; under the witness and whistleblowers of criminal offences proclamation no.699/2010 and the anti-terrorism proclamation no.1176/2010.....	23
3.4.1. Scope of application.....	23
a) Nature of the crime:	24
3.4.2. Types of measures.....	28
3.4.3. Determining the type of protection measures	29
3.4.4. Application protection measures.....	31
3.4.5. Who is entitled to apply?	31
3.4.6. Termination of protection agreement.....	31
3.5. Lack of established institution for criminal witness protection in Ethiopia.....	32
3.6. Challenges facing to Ethiopian witness protection program.....	32
CHAPTER FOUR	34
CONCLUDING REMARKS AND RECOMMENDATION	34
4.1. Conclusion.....	34
4.2. Recommendations.....	35
Bibliography	36

DECLARATION

This Thesis is my original work and submitted for award of degree of bachelor of law (LLB) under the guidance of Mr. **Marga Fekadu** my Advisor. Ideas and experience is borrowed from other authors cited. I further declare that this thesis is wholly or partly has not previously formed the basis for other similar titles.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

In this first paper, I would like to give recognition for those who in one way or another assisted me to effectively produce this work. My first deepest thank goes to the Almighty, God, who has been my help in ages past and who is also my hope for years to come.

I would like to extend my heart-felt gratitude to my thesis Advisor Mr. **Marga Fekadu** for his generous and thoughtful comments, which will in turn help me to improve my little experience in doing a research.

If I have to name all friends who have helped me one way or another for the successful completion of this work, the spaces will not be enough. I am so grateful for all friends who have helped me in the necessary materials in editing. The followings, however, cannot be left unmentioned: Dawit Gelgele, Dano Jirata and Aden Molu. You all have stretched your helping hands whenever I have asked for it and you deserve sincere appreciation. I am enormously grateful for your priceless helps. Had not been for your persistent help, this work would not have even been tried.

I am also highly indebted to those who provided me with their writings whose works served as relevant inputs to carry out my paper. Their respective work has also been duly acknowledged in the paper.

ACRONYMS

ACJHR----- the African court of justice and human rights.

APA-----Africa prosecutors association.

ECCC-----the extraordinary chambers in the court of Cambodia.

ECOSOC-----the economic and social council.

FDRE-----the federal democratic republic of Ethiopia.

ICAC-----the independent commission against corruption.

ICC-----the international criminal court.

ICTR-----the international criminal for Rwanda.

ICTY-----the international criminal tribunal for the former Yugoslavia.

SCSL-----the special court of Sieraleone.

UN-----the United Nations.

UNCAC----- the United Nations convention against corruption.

UNCTOC-----the United Nations convention against transitional organized crime.

UN GA-----the United Nations general assembly.

UNODC-----the United Nations office on drugs and crime.

WPA-----the witness protection act

ABSTRACTS

The ability of the criminal justice system to prosecute crimes of any kind largely depends on obtaining cooperation of victims and witnesses and witness protection in order to obtain important information and evidence about the commission of such criminal matters. This paper is mainly concerned with exploring what protection measures are available in Ethiopia, the eligibilities for someone to acquire the status of a protected witness through analysis of statutory legal provision and cases by the application of law or of reasoning, the study used primary sources such as international and national legal instruments, which are important for the protection of witness and secondary source of data. And finding the lack of the establishment of the institution of witness protection under the Ethiopian law. Since protection of witness is crucial in maintaining justice,

Establishing a very specialized agency aimed at closely overseeing the implementation of the witness and whistleblowers and promoting awareness creation issues of such measures. Hence, witness protection is the back bone of the criminal justice system of our country as well as international arena.

The last but not the least the paper also touches on the challenges the Ethiopian witness protection is facing.

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1, Back ground of the study

In Ethiopia it is common that hundreds of perpetrators of serious crimes continue to evade accountability. History and experience told us that numerous criminals were left free due to lack of witness¹. This can further be demonstrated by government's failure to adequately address witness protection issues.

Witness protection may not as simple as providing escort police to the court room, offering temporary residence in a safe house or using modern communication technology such as video conferencing for testimony. Even though, witness is critical for successful prosecution but the reach and strength of the threatening criminal group is so powerful that extraordinary measures are required to ensure the witness safety. In such cases resettlement of the witness under new identity, undisclosed place of residence in the country or even abroad may be the only viable alternative.

The primary objective of witness protection was to protect the physical security of witness for the purpose of securing their testimony in a criminal justice process. However, as protective practice has developed; improving witness related conduct throughout the justice system has become important because of the need to achieve witness cooperation at each phase of the justice process. Psychological, health and socio economic consideration have taken on a more prominent role in the engagement and protection of witness prior to, during and after testimony².

¹ Aberra Jamboree, *An Introduction to the Legal History of Ethiopia: 1434-1974* (Shama Books, Addis Abeba, 2012), p. 239

² Karen Kramer, *Witness Protection as a Key Tool in Tackling Serious and Organized Crime*, UNODC, 2010, PP. 2-4 some countries like Italy, Colombia, Nigeria and Kenya are heavily affected by organized crime.

Providing protection for witnesses of criminal offences plays a significant role in order to ensure the safety and Security of the public by having criminal offenders brought to justice and sustain the right penalty and uncovering crimes that may cause serious threat to the public as a whole.

Witness constitutes a person who has given or agreed to give information or has acted or agrees to act as a witness in the investigation or trial of an offence. Experts believe that without measures to protect witnesses and their families from intimidation, and the circumstances could lead to a paralysis of the justice system in some cases ³. Hence, witnesses are the foundation of a well-functioning criminal justice system as their cooperation with law enforcement and judicial authorities is essential to the successful prosecution of crimes. Because of this fact, the protection of witnesses from intimidation or physical threats is now more stringent at the international, regional or national level ⁴.

When it comes to the Ethiopian legal system, like other countries or the minimum standard of international level, the law on the method of protection of witness and persons in criminal offenses is promulgated under proclamation No. 699/2010 ⁵. The first purpose of this law is to create a favourable environment to ensure public safety and security by bringing criminal offenders justice and sustaining proper punishment. Secondly, the protection of witnesses and whistleblowers of criminal offenses as they play an important role in crime prevention by uncovering crimes that could pose a serious threat to the public. Finally, legislate the protection systems that must be put in place to protect witnesses and persons involved in criminal offenses from the direct or indirect risk of accidents and attacks as a result and thus ensure their safety ⁶.

1.2 .Statement of the problem

Prevalence of justice is unthinkable without the due and proper witness protection. Thus, evidence protection mechanisms are a necessity rather than an option for any criminal justice system. One of the main objectives of the Ethiopian Witness Protection Act is to provide physical and

³Gregory Lacko , **Witness Protection** , International Cooperation Group, Department of Justice canada,2004

⁴Ibid.

⁵ Protection of witnesses and whistleblowers in criminal offences, 2010, proc. No. 699, of the 17 the *century.No.16*, *Federal NegaritGazzeta paragraph 4, [hereafter, proc. No. 699/2010]*

⁶Ibid

psychological protection to witnesses who have well-founded and reasonable fears for their lives and the lives of their families. However, eyewitnesses are being subjected to both physical and psychological attacks. The government is required to come up with measures of witness protection which includes the enactment of laws. The intended purpose of ensuring the safety and security of the public will not be achieved in case if the government fail to come up with protection policies and programs. Government is expected to exhaust all protection measures that are being utilized by another developed country with relatively advanced witness protection program. Comparing the Ethiopian witness protection act with other common law and civil law legal systems will have its own benefits by identifying our legal gaps and drawing important legal.

The problem is compounded by the fact that neither the witnesses themselves nor even employees in the justice system have laws in place to protect witnesses and their families. Lack of budget, protection programs, protective authority and legislative measures. For example, the law did not set out clear criteria for nominating for protection and determining the responsible party. Identifying factors that contribute to witness protection is one of the focuses of this study.

1.3. Literature review

An article by H. Suresh, titled *New Law Needed to Protect Witnesses*⁷. The author has centred to focus on the malicious crimes that are meted out on the witnesses. He focused on the crimes normally undertaken by men in power, corrupted government, and habitual offenders in general. The author has referred to certain international forums like the European Commission's law. He has also raised the issue for bringing in the Bill of Rights⁸. Legislation for appropriate safeguarding of witnesses. In a similar article titled, "Witness Protection – Rights, Needs and Benefits Required to Ensure Effective Victim Testimony"⁹. Justice Jagannadha Rao highlighted that, witnesses and victim despite being a significant figure in a wrongdoing, have limited rights in their protection. He observed that if the witnesses are tarnished, then the while concept of fair trail gets petrified. In *Access to Justice: Witness Protection and Judicial Administration*¹⁰. By

⁷ H. Suresh, *New Law Needed to Protect Witnesses*, *Combat Law*, Vol. IV, Issue 1, April-May.

⁸ Ibid

⁹ Justice Jagannadha Rao, *Witness Protection – Rights, Needs and Benefits Required to Ensure Effective Victim Testimony*.

¹⁰ Justice Mandan B. Lokur, *Access to Justice: Witness Protection and Judicial Administration*.

Justice Madan B. Lokur, the author stated the difficulties that witnesses have to undergo and how, a little corruption can lead to unfair trials and harms the basic principle of natural justice. He has taken the assistance of the Law commission reports and guidelines of Delhi High court to scrutinize the matter and has come to conclusion that, mere documents and provisions of the legislation will never serve the purpose of safeguarding the witnesses unless and until the implementation of the same has been done effectively. Although these articles have realized the importance of witnesses and their role in getting fair justice, they have failed to rise the protection of property and family member of witness protection and does not tries to address what kinds of protection for witness and during what time? This is the gap filling of this literature of article and under Ethiopian witness protection law tries to address.

1.4. Objective of the study

1.4.1. General objective

The general objective of this paper (research) is to browse the available witness protection measures under Ethiopian legal system

1.4.2. Specific objective

- 1, To show the legal challenges facing in relation to witness protection in Ethiopian legal system.
- 2, To show what kind of measures are being taken to assist and support witnesses' protection in Ethiopia.
- 3, To show if there is any witness protection programs under Ethiopian law and identifying their gaps
- 4, To show Lack of established institution for criminal witness protection in Ethiopia

1.5. Research question

The research aims to address the following questions

1. What are the challenges in relation to witness protection in Ethiopian legal system?
2. What kind of support and assistance has provided for witnesses (the measures taken)?
3. Is there any witness protection or program under Ethiopian law?

1.6. Scope of the study (research)

The scope of this paper is limited to witnesses of criminal offences. This paper is dealing with what protection measures are available under the Ethiopian legal system for the one who has given or agrees to give information or has acted or agrees to act as a witness in the investigation or trial of an offense

1.7. Significance of the study

The paper has the following contributions to make:

- 1) It would identify the witness protection problems in Ethiopian legal system;
- 2) This paper helps to set out the witness protection programs
- 3) It may serve as an input for further research;
- 4) This paper creates awareness for readers as to how witness protection is important for
- 5) The dispensation of justice
- 6) To understand that witnesses strong protection in criminal justice law of Ethiopia

1.8. Methodology

1.8.1. Research design

The research has been carried by using doctrinal and uses qualitative research approach.

Through analysis of statutory legal provision and cases by the application of law or of reasoning. It gives emphasis on analysis of legal rules, principles or doctrines of relevant on the witness protection.

1.8.2. Data sources

The study used primary sources such as international and national legal instruments, which are important for the protection of witness. In addition, secondary sources such as books, published and unpublished articles, tools, websites and internet were utilized, also uses the method of legal analysis with the method of comparative analysis, identifying the practices of some countries. Some of those countries are preferred because they have well-developed data protection mechanisms under their laws, some of those country are; South Africa and Kenya have a well developed data protection program.

The study uses qualitative data analysis methods. This qualitative data analysis shows the magnitude of the problem of witness protection under Ethiopian legal system

1.9. Limitation of the study

The fact there is no enough time and budget allotted makes or forces the writer not to going in to deep analysis of witness protection under Ethiopian legal system.

1.9.1. Organization of the study

The first chapter of the study gives a general back-ground describes the research problem; provides justification for why the study has to be carried out and why it is significant; and explains the method used as well as limitation of the study.

The second chapter reviews different literatures on witness protection and different international instrument on witness protection. It also looks in to how witness protection plays a pivotal role in the dispensation of justice.

The third chapter deals with brief history of witness protection in Ethiopia. To this end it describes witness protection and limitations under the Ethiopian legal system

Fourth chapter forwards concluding remarks and recommendations

CHAPTER TWO

CONCEPTUAL FOUNDATION OF WITNESS PROTECTION

2.1 witness protection an overview

Witness protection plays an essential role in the special consideration of justice in general and prosecution of criminals in particular. In most circumstances, if there is no witness the criminal justice system will be at difficulty of prosecuting serious crimes that pose danger to the public at large. Therefore, for the sake of dispensation of justice in general and prosecution of criminals in particular the criminal justice system shall give adequate protection for witnesses. The criminal justice system shall guarantee witnesses against any form of retaliation by those against whom the testimony is given. In general, it is the duty of justice system to protect witnesses.

The criminal justice system is duty bound to provide protection measures for witnesses of criminal offence so that they can freely give their testimony. Witnesses will cooperate freely with law enforcement investigations without fear of any reprisal if and only if the justice system serves as a watch dog of their life and property. The ability of witnesses to give testimony in judicial setting to cooperate with law enforcement investigations without fear of intimidation or reprisal is essential to maintain rule of law. The maintenance of rule of law will almost remain a mere wish in the presence of a witness who can freely appear and testify before court. To achieve this purpose of maintenance of rule of law countries are required to come up with laws, policies and programs that are capable of giving adequate protection for witnesses. Witness protection programs serve many purposes. They provide opportunities for victims and witnesses to participate in a criminal process with the expectation that they and their families will not be put in danger. They offer the hope of accountability and threatened witnesses away to seek shelter from the scene of victimization.

Witness protection provides a space in which individual traumas may be treated and enables a victim/witness to regain more control over their life it can also lead to a serious disruption of the life style of the witness and any person accompanying them in to the program. It may even have implication on third parties. For these reasons witness protection programs must have a good

foundation in legislation or policy. Increasingly countries are adopting policies or enacting legislations to protect witness whose cooperation with law enforcement authorities or testimony in court of law would endanger their lives or those of their families ¹¹.

Criminal activities that have a profound impact on human security and development, such as corruption, drug trafficking, serious and organized crime, human rights violation and terrorism will not be prevented at least to its minimum level without according adequate protection of witnesses¹². Consequently the ability criminal justice systems to investigate and prosecute such forms of serious crime are often very limited. One of the challenges for many is in obtaining the cooperation of witnesses and victims and witness protection in order to obtain important evidence and information about such criminal matters¹³.

One way of sorting out this problem is by guaranteeing witnesses life and property against reprisal by the accused or his relative by coming up with witness protection programs.

The successful prosecution of crimes largely depends on securing reliable evidence, including the testimony of witnesses. And it is obvious that reliable evidence cannot be secured in case the state failed to guarantee the witnesses not to be subject to reprisal by those who are prosecuted as a result of the witnesses' testimony. When witnesses withdraw from proceeding due to intimidation or actual harm, securing conviction often becomes impossible. For this reason the protection of witnesses remains corner stone to an effective criminal justice system. Experience shows, however that individuals are not willing unless they have confidence that the state will protect their rights and safety as well as those of their immediate family. This would be nothing if we do not come up with the comprehensive definition of what witness and witness protection program is. The following section will try to look in to the definition of these terms.

¹¹ (Karen, Elaine (2014), Research number. 43 witness programs in selected countries: Annotated Bibliography.Ottawa,on:public safety Canada).

¹² Karen Kramer, witness protection as key tool in addressing serious and organized crime.

¹³ Wilson Kiprono,KibetNigetich,WokebiMwangi , Challenges facing to criminal justice system in relation to witness protection in Kenya-IOSR journal of humanities and social science Vol20.

2.1.1. Witness and witness protection program defined

Different literatures define witness differently. To begin with: Witness is any person who according to law on criminal procedure, has the role of witness, and possesses information for the committing of the crime, the perpetrator, and other relevant circumstances, i.e. Data and information relevant for the criminal procedure which are necessary and crucial for proving the criminal act, by which revealing the life, health, freedom, physical integrity or property of higher amount of the witnesses are exposed to danger¹⁴.

Witness refers to any persons irrespective of his or her legal status [informant, witness, judicial official undercover agent or other], who is eligible under the legislation or policy a country involved, to be considered for admission to a witness protection program¹⁵. Witness is someone that gives evidence regarding matters of fact under inquiry or someone who is legally qualified to testify in a cause or to give evidence before a judicial tribunal¹⁶. Witness protection program on the other hand refers to a formally established covert program subject to strict admission criteria that provides for the relocation or change of identity of witnesses who lives are threatened by a criminal group because of their cooperation with law enforcement authorities¹⁷. Witness protection program is a federal or state program in which a person who testifies against a criminal is assigned a new identity and relocated to another part of the country as a result of such testimony¹⁸.

Witness protection refers to range of measures which can be applied at any stage of criminal proceedings, to ensure the safety of witnesses to gain their cooperation in obtaining testimony. This includes concealing the identity of witnesses through the use of image and voice distortion, other measures relates to the physical protection of witnesses or members of their families. This may include their temporary or permanent relocation, changing their identity, and-in extreme circumstances-cosmetic surgery to alter their physical appearance. Video conferencing and pseudonyms while giving testimony, and anonymous testimony¹⁹. The covert nature of witness

¹⁴ Law on witness protection, unofficial translation in compliance with official gazette No.38/2005 courtesy of the OSCE mission to Skopje

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ Webster third new international dictionary, page 2627

¹⁷Wilson Supra note 4.

¹⁸ Black's law dictionary, 8th edition.

¹⁹Wilson Supra note 4.

protection is paramount in encouraging witnesses to come forward²⁰. Guaranteeing the protection of physical witnesses in such crimes gives courts the opportunity to listen to their testimony and evaluate the evidence. This especially is true in cases involving powerful individuals with links to influential networks and institutions.

2.2 International developments on witness protection

The importance of witness protection is recognized through various legal regimes, policies and declarations. Different international and regional human right instruments has accorded protection for witnesses to enable them cooperate with the law enforcement organs for the maintenance of rule of law. The UN has several instruments that promote cooperation in witness protection area.²¹ For example, both the UN Convention against Corruption, and the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime [UNTOC], and its protocols calls upon state parties to provide protection and support of witnesses and victims. This includes among other measures, special arrangements for giving evidence and the consideration of relocation agreements.²²

The UNTOC also calls upon each state party to provide effective protection from potential retaliation or intimidation for witnesses and experts who give testimony²³. The UN Convention against Transnational and Organized Crimes requires state party to take appropriate measures to provide effective protection from retaliation or intimidation for witnesses who give testimony in cases involving transnational organized crimes²⁴. State party to this convention are required to take appropriate measures to encourage persons who participate or participated in organized criminal groups to cooperate with law enforcement authorities for investigative and evidentiary purpose²⁵. The protection of witness is also explicitly addressed in the protocol to the organized crime convention, especially in the protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children, supplementing the UN convention against Transnational Organized Crimes²⁶. And the protocol against smuggling of migrants by Land, sea and Air

²⁰Ibid.

²¹ OAS General secretariat study on the cooperation-on the protection of victims and witnesses

²² Arts.24&25 of the UNTOC.

²³Antonio Maria supra notes 2.

²⁴ Art.24 of UNTOC, General Assembly resolution 55/25,annex 1.

²⁵ Art.26 of UNTOC.

²⁶ General Assembly resolution 55/25, annex 2 Arts.6&7

supplementing the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime²⁷. On the recommendation of the commission on crime prevention and criminal justice, the Economic and Social Council encouraged member state to exchange their experience with and information on action taken to provide effective protection for witnesses in criminal proceedings involving transnational and national organized crime and for their relatives and all other persons close to them²⁸. The Declaration of Basic Principles of Justice for Victims of Crime and Abuse of Power, adopted by the UN General Assembly in 1985, and the UN Economic and Social Council Resolution 2005/20 also include provisions for witness protection. Similarly, International Criminal tribunal and special courts also have special provisions geared towards the protection of witnesses. These include the International Court of Crime (ICC) the International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia (ICTY), and the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR), the Special Court of Sieraleone (SCSL), and the extraordinary chambers in the court of Cambolia (ECCC)²⁹.

The UN office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) has also published important comprehensive materials to support witness protection. The UNODC recommends minimum requirements for protection of witness including legislations, protection measures to be used; application and admission criteria and procedures, termination criteria, confidentiality of its operations and penalties for disclosure³⁰. In Africa, the importance of effective witness protection in prosecution of international crimes has also been asserted through the recently amended statute of African Court of Justice and Human Rights (ACJHR), and the AU Draft Model National law on Universal Jurisdiction over international crimes. The African Prosecutors Association, through its various declarations, also seeks to promote effective witness protection in Africa. At the national level, however, formalized witness protection in Africa is not well developed. In 1998, South Africa becomes the first African country to promulgate a comprehensive witness protection law. Kenya, also took this important step and amended the witness protection act of 2006, and now has amended witness protection act of 2010, there by enacting witness protection legislation among

²⁷ General Assembly resolution 55/25, annex3 AArts.5&16

²⁸ Economic and Social Council resolution 2005/16

²⁹Antonio Mariupra note 2

³⁰ Ibid.

other things, established a dedicating and independent witness protection agency. Ethiopia, Rwanda, morocco and Mozambique also have witness protection laws³¹.

Witness protection is administratively expensive and complex. It needs to include physical protection, Provision for daily living requirement of witness and, in many cases their families, ensuring the witness abide by the set of rules to protect their safety guarding against interference by authorities and others, and ensuring that custodians of the operation are trustworthy. Especially these days due to the advancement of technology witnesses are becoming victims of danger³².

2.3. Witness protection, Brief history

Witness protection first come in to prominence in the United States of America, in the 1970's as a legally sanctioned procedure to be used in conjunction with a program for dismantling a mafia style criminal organization. Until that time, the unwritten "code of silence" among the members of the mafia-known as Omerta-held unchallenged sway, threatening death to anyone who broke ranks and cooperated with the police³³

The notion of witness protection as understood today arose from the notorious Valachi case of 1962 In the United States. Joe Valachi, himself a man with criminal record, had agreed to give evidence by breaking Omerta, the code of silence, about the inner workings of the mafia. His cooperation was driven by the fear that he would be murdered by Vito Genovese, a powerful mafia family boss. When Valachi before the committee, he was guarded by 200 US marshals. He was the first person in US to be offered protection for testimony prior to a formal witness protection program. Valachi entered in to protective custody and remained in prison until the end of his natural life. The prosecution was an important one with extensive implication for the general effectiveness of law enforcement. Generally, Valachi was highly likely to be murdered by his former associates before he could appear in court. From that case there developed the US witness protection program of 1970, which by 2005, had taken in to care more than 7500 witnesses thought to be at risk along with more than 9600 family members³⁴.

³¹Wilson, supra note 4.

³²Ibid.

³³Antonio Maria, supra note 2.

³⁴ Ibid.

2.4. Witness protection in certain countries

Today witness protection is viewed as a crucial tool in combating organized crime, and a large number of countries around the globe has established such specialized program or have legislated their creation³⁵. Examples from different jurisdictions that have decided to establish witness protection programs and their main elements are provided here in below³⁶.

2.4.1. Witness protection in South Africa

Prior to the adoption of the 1996 National Crime Prevention Strategy, witness protection in South Africa was governed by section 185A of the Criminal Procedure Act of 1977. The relevant provisions were repressive in nature and were used during the apartheid regime as a means to coerce witnesses to give evidence. The 1996 strategy recognized witness protection as a key tool in securing evidence from vulnerable and intimidated witnesses in judicial proceedings and acknowledged that witness protection was, at the time, a weak link in the criminal justice system. In 2000, Witness Protection Act 112 of 1998 was promulgated, replacing the old system.

The new law:

- (a) Established the national Office for Witness Protection under the authority of the Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development. The Office is headed by a national director at the country level and has branch offices in South Africa's nine provinces. Although legislative amendments have yet to be made, in 2001 the Office Was provisionally reorganized as part of the National Prosecuting Authority and has since been known as the Witness Protection Unit;
- (b) Regulates the functions and duties of the Director, including the power to decide on admission to the programmed. The Director's decision is based on the recommendations of the branch office head and the relevant officials from law enforcement agencies and the National Prosecuting Authority. The Director's decision to refuse an application or to discharge a person from protection may be reviewed by the Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development;
- (c) Defines the types of crimes for which witnesses may request protection, the procedure to be followed and the persons eligible to apply. The list of offences is not exclusive as the Director has

³⁵ Ibid.

³⁶ Antonio Maria, supra note 2.

the discretion to approve protection for a witness in respect of any other proceedings if satisfied that the safety of the witness warrants it;

(d) Provides that civil proceedings pending against a protected witness may be suspended by a judge in chambers, under an ex parte application, to prevent disclosure of the identity or whereabouts of the witness or to achieve the objectives of the Act. The Office for Witness Protection is the address at which legal proceedings may be instituted with regard to such a witness;

e) Defines offences and severe penalties for any disclosure or publication of information regarding persons admitted to the program or officials of the Office for Witness Protection so as to ensure the safety of protected witnesses and program officials. The decision whether any information is to be disclosed lies with the Director, after consideration of representations and without prejudice to any other applicable law;

(f) Provides that the Minister of Justice and Constitutional Development may enter into agreements with other countries or international organizations regulating the conditions and criteria for the relocation of foreign witnesses to South Africa and their admission to South Africa's witness protection program. Any such relocation requires ministerial approval.³⁷

2.4.2. Witness protection program in Germany

Witness protection programs have been in place in Germany since the mid-1980s. They were first used in Hamburg in connection with crimes related to motorcycle gangs. In the following years, they were systematically implemented by other German states and the Federal Criminal Police Office. In 1998, the Witness Protection Act was promulgated. The Act included provisions that

Regulated criminal proceedings, with a focus on:

(a) Use of video technology for interviewing at-risk witnesses (especially children testifying as victims);

(b) Improved possibilities for ensuring the confidentiality of personal data of witnesses at all stages of criminal proceedings;

³⁷Wilson, super note p15.

(c) Provision of legal assistance for victims and witnesses. Gravity of the offence, the extent of the risk, the rights of the accused and the impact of the measures;

(d) Confidentiality of information relating to the personal data of protected witnesses within witness protection units and other government and non-state agencies. The files on protected witnesses are maintained by the protection units and are not included in the investigation files, but they are made available to the prosecution on request; Conditions for the issuance of a cover identity and supporting personal documentation and the allowances to be provided for the duration of protection. Germany's witness protection program consists of witness protection offices established at the federal level and in each state. The Federal Criminal Police Office is responsible for the protection of witnesses in federal cases and for coordinating functions at the National and international levels, including:

- a) Preparation of an annual report on the witness protection program;
- b) Organization and conduct of training and continuing education;
- c) Organization of regular conferences involving the directors of federal and state witness Protection offices;
- d) Cooperation between states, federal agencies and offices located abroad;
- e) International cooperation.

In addition, the Federal State Project Group on Quality Assurance in the Field of Witness Protection – comprised of the directors of seven state witness protection offices and chaired by the Federal Criminal Police Office – ensures effective cooperation through the development of a uniform nationwide procedure for admission to the program, creation of a standardized catalogue of requirements for witness protection case workers and common concepts for training and continuing education.³⁸

2.4.3. Witness protection in Italy

As far back as 1930, the Italian Criminal Code provided for partial or total immunity from punishment if the offender made reparations for criminal damage or cooperated with authorities in cases of political conspiracy or gang-related activities. In the 1970s, the violent rise of the Red Brigades, a Marxist-Leninist terrorist group, propelled the enactment of a series of laws to encourage dissociation from terrorist groups and collaboration with the authorities. Although those

³⁸Antonio Maria, *supra* note 2. p 12

measures are considered to have been instrumental in the dismantling of the Red Brigades, none of those laws provided collaborators with formal witness protection per se.

It was not until 1984, when the Sicilian Mafioso Tommaso Buscetta turned against the Mafia and started his career as a justice collaborator, that witness protection became formalized. Buscetta was the star witness in the so-called Maxi-Trial, which led to almost 350 Mafia members being sent to prison. In exchange for his help, he was relocated under a new identity. Those events spurred more Mafia members to cooperate, with the result that by the end of the 1990s the Italian authorities had benefited from the services of more than 1,000 justice collaborators.

At the same time, the Italian process was increasingly being criticized for the questionable credibility of witnesses and their motivations, and there were allegations of disorganization and mismanagement of the witness protection program. In response, a comprehensive revision to Decree-Law No. 82 of 15 March 1991 was undertaken and entered into force in January 2001. One of the main components of the revised legislation was to create within the witness protection program a separate structure for justice collaborators³⁹.

The main provisions of Decree-Law No. 82, as amended in 2001, are as follows:

(a) Persons eligible for protection:

- (I) Witnesses and informants in drug-related Mafia or murder cases;
- (ii) Witnesses to any offence carrying a sentence of between 5 and 20 years;
- (iii) Individuals close to collaborators who are in danger;

(b) Types of protection:

- (I) A “temporary plan” involving relocation and subsistence for 180 days;
 - (ii) “Special measures” involving protection and social reintegration plans
- Relocated individuals;

³⁹ Ibid.p14

(iii) A “special protection program” which provides relocation, provisional Identity

Documentation, financial assistance and (as a last resort) new legal Identities;

(c) Justice collaborators who receive prison sentences must serve at least a quarter of their Sentence or, if they have a life sentence, 10 years in prison before they are admitted in to the protection program;

(d) Decisions on admission are taken by a central commission comprised of:

(I) the Under-Secretary of State at the Ministry of the Interior;

(ii) Two judges or prosecutors;

(iii) Five experts in the field of organized crime;

(e) Changes in identity must be authorized by the Central Protection Service, which is

Responsible for the implementation and enforcement of protection measures.

2.4.4. Witness protection in Australia

In 1983, a royal commission highlighted the need in Australia for better use to be made of informers in the fight against organized crime and, accordingly, for lower-level players to be given an incentive to inform on organizers. At that time, arrangements for witness protection were a matter for individual police forces and approaches differed, with some placing emphasis on 24-hour protection and others preferring relocation of witnesses under new identities. In 1988, a joint parliamentary committee conducted a comprehensive inquiry into the issue of witness protection and its report led directly to the introduction at the Commonwealth level of the Witness Protection Act 1994 and the enactment of mirror legislation in several states and the Australian Capital Territory. The Act:

Establishes the National Witness Protection Program (NWPP) and sets threshold criteria for a person to be considered a witness eligible for inclusion in NWPP. A witness becomes a “participant” once accepted into the program;

- (a) Vests the Australian Federal Police with the authority to govern the placement of witnesses under and their removal from NWPP, including the signing of memorandums of understanding, the creation of new identities and the restoration of former identities;
- (b) Mandates the establishment of a register of participants currently or previously under NWPP, which must contain information such as the person's name and new identity and details of offences of which the participant has been convicted;
- (c) Safeguards the integrity of Commonwealth identity documents (tax file numbers, passports) by providing that identity documents for participants in sub national witness protection programmes may not be issued unless complementary legislation and ministerial arrangements are in place in the state or territory relating to the issue of identity documents;
- (d) Provides mechanisms to ensure that participants do not use their new identity to evade civil or criminal liability and stipulates that witnesses may not be included in NWPP as a means of encouraging or rewarding them for giving evidence or making a statement;
- (e) Creates offences relating to the unlawful divulging of information about participants and
- (f) Creates offences for participants who disclose information related to NWPP.

In 1997, the Act was amended to allow NWPP participants to make disclosures for the Purpose of filing a complaint or providing information to the Commonwealth Ombudsman.

In 2002, the Act was further amended to permit the inclusion of persons in NWPP at the Request of the International Criminal Court. The process for considering a person Nominated by the Court for admission to NWPP is similar to the process for the inclusion of foreign nationals or residents in NWPP.⁴⁰

- As of this writing, the following states and territories of Australia had enacted regional witness protection schemes complementary to NWPP:
- Australian Capital Territory: Witness Protection Act 1996
- New South Wales: Witness Protection Act 1995
- Northern Territory: Witness Protection (Northern Territory) Act 2002

⁴⁰Ibid. page 9.

- Queensland: Witness Protection Act 2000
- South Australia: Witness Protection Act 1996
- Tasmania: Witness Protection Act 2000
- Victoria: Witness Protection Act 1999
- Western Australia: Witness Protection (Western Australia) Act 1996

2.4.5. Witness protection in Colombia

Colombia's witness protection program has its origins in the Constitution of 1991, which listed among the main functions of the Office of the Attorney General the obligation to provide protection for witnesses, victims and other parties to criminal proceedings. Law No. 418 of 1997 established three distinct witness protection programs accessible upon application to the Office of the Attorney General. The first provides witnesses with information and recommendations for their own safety; the second provides limited monitoring of witness's situations; and the third involves a change of identity and covers victims, witnesses, parties to proceedings and officials of the Office of the Attorney General. The third program is managed by a special directorate head quartered in Bogota and with regional offices in Barranquilla, Cali, Cucuta and Medellin. There are two divisions: one for operations and one for administrative matters. A special team of investigators is responsible for evaluating criminal investigations, studying witness participation in proceedings and ultimately assessing the level of risk and threat that arises as a direct consequence of such participation. In addition, there is an assistance group (made up of physicians and dentists), a support network with administrative responsibility for persons already covered by the program, and a security group responsible for implementing all the protection measures ordered by the Directorate following the threat assessment.

The third program is open only to witnesses in cases involving kidnapping, terrorism and drug trafficking and provides for the permanent relocation inside Colombia and change of identity for witnesses at risk. Witnesses receive financial assistance to start a new life, together with psychological support, medical care, counselling and assistance with resettlement and the issuance of new personal document.

CHAPTER THREE

WITNESS PROTECTION UNDER ETHIOPIAN LEGAL SYTEM

3.1. General introduction

So far, in the preceding chapter, I have been discussing witness protection from international perspective. I have been discussing United Nations human right instruments on witness protection particularly UNTOC. Moreover, I have discussed witness protection in different countries. Witness protection as I have discussed on the conceptual foundation part of the paper is a recent phenomenon to which Ethiopia is not an exception with this regard. The concept and importance of witness as opposed to witness protection however is not a recent one. Different grand legal literatures in Ethiopia including Feteha Negest also called the law of kings have incorporated a provision governing witness. However witness protection as a tool prevalence of justice in general and prosecution of criminals in particular is a new development. The 2004 criminal code of Ethiopia under one article has addressed the issue of witness protection crudely.⁴¹

Based on a call made by united nation human right instruments like United Nations Convention against Crime (UNCAC) and United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (UNCTOC) up on states, to which Ethiopia is a party, to take appropriate measures for the protection of witnesses, experts and victims against retaliation or intimidation as a result of their testimony. These may include measures to insure the physical and psychological protection of witnesses as well as for providing evidentiary rules allowing a witness to testify in a manner that ensures his or her safety.⁴² It is based on this international call and the pressing need to give adequate protection for witnesses and whistleblowers that Ethiopia come up with a comprehensive law governing witness safety.

⁴¹ Art. 444 of criminal code of the federal democratic republic of Ethiopia (FDRE).

⁴² Art.24 of the United Nation Convention against Crime (UNCAC).

At minimum, legislation should specify the authority responsible for the programs implementation admission, termination criteria and procedures the protection measures that may be used and the rights and obligations of the parties , ensure that the programs operation are confidential; and provide adequate penalties for the disclosure of information about the identity or location of the protected witness. It is all about this that I am supposed to deal with under this chapter.

Under this chapter I am going to explore the witness protection under Ethiopian legal system. Whether witness protection has constitutional foundation or not and what other subsidiary laws says about witness protection is the main concern of this chapter.

3.2. Witness protection under FDRE constitution

The relevant provision of FDRE constitution with regard to witness protection is Art.29 (2).Art.29 (2)...Everyone has the right to freedom of expression without any interference. This right shall include freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers, either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of art, or through any media of his choice.

Therefore, witnesses like any other individuals have this kind of right of freedom of expression. As you can see from the article this right of freedom of expression includes three freedoms under it. That is freedom to seek information and ideas of all kinds, freedom to receive information and ideas of all kinds and freedom to impart information and ideas of all kinds which has very much importance to my discussion. To impart means to transmit or give whatever information, idea, knowledge....that you have to third party. Therefore witnesses like any other individual has this constitutional right give any information they know about the commission of a certain criminal offence. Hence, witnesses while testifying about the commission of a certain criminal act they **are** just exercising their freedom to impart information and ideas of all kinds which is an inbuilt element of the freedom of expression. Therefore it is cogent to argue that the idea of witness protection has a constitutional basis or foundation under the Ethiopian legal system.

Article 9(4) of the constitution: all international agreement ratified by Ethiopia is an integral part of the law of the land. As Ethiopia as a members of UN, any Resolution that will be passed by the UN, Ethiopia will be obliged to accepted. This Resolution means witness protection under the United Nation convention against Transnational Organized Crime (UNTOC) and United Nation

Convention against Corruption (UNCAC) until no reservation as the integral part of law of the land.⁴³ So witness protection have a constitutional foundation under our FDRE.

Art.13 (1) of the constitution: All federal and state legislative, executive and judicial organs at all levels shall have the responsibility and duty to respect and enforce the provisions this Chapter. The very incorporation of this article under Chapter three of the constitution imposes a duty upon every organs of the government of both level to enforce and respect this very article. The constitution is making a call upon organs of government at both level to play their utmost duty and responsibility to ensure that the safety of witnesses and whistle blowers who provide information about the commission of a certain crime and ultimately support the maintenance of rule of law. Therefore it is fair to conclude that witness protection has a constitutional foundation in Ethiopia

3.3. Witness protection under the criminal code of FDRE

Under this section of the paper I am going to see whether the 2004 criminal code of Ethiopia has something to say about witness protection.

Art.444. - Crimes against Whistleblowers or Witnesses.

(1) Who ever assaults, suppresses or harms any person who gives information or evidence to justice authorities or is a witness in criminal cases, is punishable with simple imprisonment or fine.

(2) Where the crime has entailed grave harm to the body or health of the victim or his death, the relevant provision concerning such matters shall apply concurrently.

The law clearly criminalizes individuals who assault, suppress or harm a witness or whistleblowers who gives information or evidence to justice authorities about the commission of a certain criminal offence. Witness protection as a pillar or cornerstone for the maintenance of rule of law in general and prosecution of criminals in particular is dully incorporated under the 2004 criminal code of the federal democratic republic of Ethiopia though crudely. So far, under this chapter we have been looking at about the constitutional foundation of witness protection and its incorporation under the criminal code and I am concerned at exploring whether we have a proclamation specifically devoted to witness protection. Yes, we do

⁴³ Id, Art 9(4).FDR constitution.

3.4. Witness protection; under the witness and whistleblowers of criminal offences proclamation no.699/2010 and the anti-terrorism proclamation no.1176/2010

Art.2 (1) ‘whistleblowers or witness’ means a person who has given or agrees to give information or has acted or agrees to act as a witness in the investigation or trial of an offence. Before defining as to who witnesses or whistleblowers are the proclamation has stipulated a general objective for having witness protection legislation in Ethiopia. The general objectives are here in order;

a) having criminal offenders brought to justice and sustain the right penalty so that the safety and the security of the public at large will be ensured. This objective is also re iterated under the preamble of the proclamation on anti-terrorism which strives to maintain the right of the people to live in peace, freedom and security and be protected from the threat of terrorism. To achieve this general objective both proclamations come up with witness protection provisions.

b) Provision of protection for witnesses and whistleblowers of criminal offence plays a significant role for the prevention of crimes by uncovering crimes that may cause serious threat or danger to the public.⁴⁴ It has been enacted to protect witnesses and whistleblowers of a criminal offense from direct or indirect danger and attack they may face as a consequence thereof and thereby to ensure their safety. Having said this much about the general objective that the witnesses and whistleblowers proclamation in one hand and the anti-terrorism proclamation on the other hand under mind, it is now better to look at the scope of protection this proclamations give.

3.4.1. Scope of application

Who are the witnesses eligible for protection under these two proclamations will be dealt this subsection.

Art.3 of the witnesses and whistleblowers proclamation is all about its scope of application.

⁴⁴ Protection of Witnesses and Whistleblowers of Criminal Offences, Proclamation No.699/2010, Paragraph 3 of the Preamble.

- 1) The protection under this proclamation shall be applicable with respect to testimony or information given or investigation undertaken on a suspect punishable with rigorous imprisonment for ten or more years or with death without having regard to the minimum period of imprisonment:
 - a) where the offence may not be revealed or established by another means otherwise than by the testimony of the witness or the information of the whistleblower; and
 - b) Where it is believed that a threat of serious danger exists to the life, physical security, freedom or property of the witness, the whistleblower or a family member of the witness or the whistleblower.
- 2) Notwithstanding the provisions of sub article (1) of this article, the ministry and the commission may also extend the protections provided under sub article (1),(l), (m), (o), (p) and (t) of article (4) of this proclamation to witnesses and whistleblowers who are not protected persons.

This very article provides three (3) criteria for witnesses to be eligible for protection under this proclamation.

a) Nature of the crime:

The testimony or information given or investigation undertaken on a suspect must be punishable with rigorous imprisonment for ten or more years or death without having regard to the minimum period of imprisonment. As to this article not all commission of crimes reported by a witness entitle him a protection under this proclamation. The provision has clearly provided as to what kind of crimes, if a witness has given information may be entitled protection. The suspect revealed by the help of the information of the witness or whistle-blower must be punishable with rigorous imprisonment for ten or more years. The last phrase of Art.3 (1) ... without having due regard to the minimum period of rigorous imprisonment...seems to tell us that the minimum period of imprisonment may be lessor than ten what really matters is whether the person(suspect) can be punished with ten years' rigorous imprisonment or more, death. The minimum limit of punishment is insignificant here. Let say for example a certain crime 'x' is punishable with rigorous imprisonment of 8 to 12 years. Therefore, a witness who testifies the commission of this crime cannot be exempted from protection under this proclamation under this proclamation for the mere fact that the minimum limit of punishment is lessor than ten years

b) [Nature of the information revealed;](#)

The information revealed by the witness shall be such nature that cannot be established by another means otherwise than by the testimony of the witness or the information of the whistle-blower. The information of the whistle-blower or testimony of the witness must be very indispensable without which it is very less probable to uncover the allegedly committed crime.

c) [Threat of serious danger;](#)

When it is believed that as a result of his testimony of the witness or information of the whistle-blower is at serious danger of his life, physical security, freedom or property of the witness, the whistle-blower or the family member of the witness or the whistle-blower. However, this proclamation fails to qualify as to what constitutes serious danger? What extent of believe is required to show that such serious dander do exist? The article precisely stipulated as to who are the beneficiaries of the protection regime. The witness or the whistle-blower, his life, physical security, freedom or property of the witness and their family are beneficiaries of protection under this proclamation.

Art.2 (7) of the same proclamation has defined as to what constitutes family? Family includes the spouse or cohabitant, the children, parents, siblings and the children of the spouse or cohabitant of a person. Therefore, this all lists are beneficiaries of protection under this proclamation. As to my understanding the word cohabitant under the said article refers to the party to an irregular union. The protection under this proclamation is not limited to legitimate children but also includes the illegitimate ones. The three listed eligibilities for witness protection under the witnesses and whistle-blowers proclamation are cumulative in which all must coexist for a witness or whistle-blower to get protection under this proclamation.

As can be easily inferred from Art.2 (2) the witnesses and whistle-blowers proclamation for a witness or whistle-blower to get protection under this proclamation must be entered into a protection agreement with the ministry of justice.

Art.3(2) of the proclamation notwithstanding the provision s of sub article one the ministry of justice and the federal ethics and anti-corruption commission may extend the scope of protection

under Art 4(1)(l)(m)(o)(p)(t) to witnesses and whistle blowers who are not protected persons.⁴⁵ For instance, the ministry and the commission may order the relocation cost to be covered when the protection measure entails relocation even if the person is not protected under this proclamation. Therefore, this article has given the ministry and the commission a discretionary power to extend the scope of application ability of the protection measure to non-protected only under the sub articles of article four listed under Art 2(3).

Art 16 of the anti-terrorism proclamation no.1176/2010 is about protection of witnesses

Where the life, wellbeing of property of any person or his family is endangered for being a witness or whistle-blower of terrorist crimes, he shall be given protection in accordance with the Protection of Witnesses and Whistleblowers of Criminal Offences Proclamation No.699/2010.

Without prejudice to Sub-Article (1) of this Article, the court hearing the case may take the following measures:

- a) Change the Venue
- b) Cause not to publish or record the court proceedings in part or in whole or to be released in any form
- 3) Whosoever contravenes the order made in accordance with Sub-article (2) of this Article shall be punished with simple imprisonment; where the act hinders the judicial proceedings or endangers the witness, the punishment shall be rigorous imprisonment from one year to seven years and with fine not exceeding Birr fifty thousand.⁴⁶

Article 12 of anti-terrorism proclamation no.1176/2010. Crimes Committed against Whistle blower and Witnesses. There are a punishment:

- 1) Whosoever interferes to prevent a person who may be whistle-blower or witness or who has evidence of crime provided under this proclamation from giving information or evidence to justice authorities or being a witness in an investigation or judicial proceeding by using sabotage,

⁴⁵ Protection measures listed under Art. 3(2) of proclamation no. 699/2010 who are not protected person.

⁴⁶ Anti-Terrorism Proclamation No. 1176/2010, Art 16.

violence, threat or by extending undue advantage, by inducements or getting involved in any other way against such person or a person who has close relationship with him shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment from three years to seven years.

2) Whosoever assaults, threats, suppresses or harms any person or a person who has close relationship with such person, who gave information or evidence to justice authorities or appeared as witness in an investigation or judicial proceeding of crime

Provided for in this Proclamation shall be punishable with rigorous imprisonment from three years to seven years.

3) Where the crime mentioned in Sub-article (1) or (2) of this Article entailed grave harm to the body or health of the victim or his death, the relevant laws related to these crimes shall apply concurrently.

The scope of protection proclamation to be given under this proclamation seems equal compared with the witnesses and whistleblowers proclamation.

Under both proclamation it is equal protection of witness life, property of the witness and their families. Here the protection of witness under anti-terrorism proclamation in accordance to whistleblowers and witness protection proclamation. Are they out of the realm of this proclamation or are we going to cross refer to the witness protection proclamation? For me witness of a terrorist act requires no lessor protection than witnesses we have discussed under the witnesses and whistleblowers proclamation.

For the following basic reasons, I am arguing that a witness to a terrorist act shall at least be provided with equal protection with witnesses under the witnesses and whistleblowers proclamation;

- a) Due to the high level of cooperation required to avert terrorist act and which without giving larger protection for the witness who testify is unattainable;
- b) The danger that terrorism poses to the public peace and development of the country in particular and the globe in general;
- c) The extent of danger to which the life of the witness is to be exposed is high.

3.4.2. Types of measures

The witnesses and whistle-blowers proclamation has provided a slew of protection measures for witnesses who testify and whistle-blowers that provide information and entered in to the protection agreement accordingly. protection measures are measures that are needed to be implemented by the ministry and commission to ensure the safety of the witness or whistle-blower.

The protection measures listed under Art.4 (1) of the witnesses and whistle-blowers proclamation can be employed to a person separately or in combination as the case may be.

The following protection measures may be employed for a protected person as the case may be

- a) Physical protection of a person and property
- b) Providing a secure residence including relocation; Art 2(3) has precisely defined as to what constitutes relocation. Relocation means a type of protection measure that involves temporary or permanent resettling of the protected person by the ministry in a place with in the country or overseas, other than his place of residence or if the protected person is undergoing a penalty entailing loss of liberty, the transfer of him to another penitentiary.
- c) Concealing identity and ownership: means a type of protection measure that involves temporary creation and use of documents relating to the identity and property of a protected person⁴⁷.
- d) Change of identity: as to Art 2(4) of the witnesses and whistleblowers proclamation means a type of protection method that involves modifying and adjusting parts or entire personal data of a protected person to a new situation and may include plastic surgery where necessary.
- e) Provision of self-defence weapon;
- f) Immunity from prosecution for an offence for which he renders information;
- g) Prohibiting an accused person from reaching the protected persons residence, work place or school before or after a final judgment is delivered on the crime for which information is given;

⁴⁷ Art. 2(6) proclamation No.699/2010 A proclamation to provide for the protection of witnesses and whistleblowers of criminal offences

- h) Not to disclose the identity of the witness until the trial process begins and the witness testifies;
- i) Hearing testimony in camera;
- j) Hearing testimony behind screen or by disguising identity;
- k) Producing evidence by electronic devices or any other method;
- l) Unless it is deemed confidential, providing information regarding the progress of investigation on what has been whistle blown and advice to a witness;
- m) Providing transport allowance and per diem to a witness summoned to testify ;
- n) Covering relocation cost where the protection measure entails relocation;
- o) Suspension or revocation of retaliatory administrative measures or taking any other compensatory measure;
- p) Provision of medical treatment free of charge at government hospitals in case of injury sustained as a result of retaliatory measure;
- q) Covering costs of basic needs in case of incapacity to work as a result of retaliatory measure;
- r) In case of death as a result of retaliatory measure, covering funeral expenses and provision of pecuniary subsidy to family;
- s) Assisting the protected person to secure opportunity;
- t) Providing and causing the provision of counseling service to the witness or whistleblower.

Notwithstanding the provisions of sub article (1) of article 4 a protected person may not be issued with professional certificate that he/she does not rightly possess for the sake of protection.

3.4.3. Determining the type of protection measures

This part addresses issues that need to be taken in to consideration while determining the type of protection measure to be provided for a protected person. There are specific measures needed to be provided for a specific protected person. The issues needed to be taken in to account are provided here in below. Art.5 of the witnesses and whistleblowers proclamation;(1) nature of the imminent danger to which the protected person is exposed shall be taken seriously in to account while determining the type of protection measure for example relocation of the witness permanently to a foreign country may fall under this category;

- 1) Where the protected person has a criminal record, whether or not the intended protection measure entails risk to the public. Whether or not if the protected person is provided with such protection measure concomitant further crime is the issue need to be considered here. For example if we provide the witness, with a previous criminal record, with a defense weapon he may commit further crime which is a threat to the public in such circumstances we shall resort to other protection measures;
- 2) The damage that the intended protection measure may cause to the rights and lawful benefits of another shall also be considered. I think this is the extension of the principle of personal nature of crimes which is inculcated under the criminal code of Ethiopia. The crime committed by someone shall not have an effect on the rights and benefits of another third party;
- 3) The health and living conditions of the protected shall also be taken in to consideration. For example if the protected person is economically weak or poor protection measures like covering basic needs may be appropriate. In case the witness becomes incapacitated due to retaliatory measure.
- 4) Competence of the protected person to adopt himself with the intended protection measure. The provision of self-defence measure shall take in to account this matter. If he is for example very weak person may be due to senility it may not be appropriate to provide him with self-defence weapon;
- 5) Cost to be incurred for the protection measure shall also be taken in to account. As much as possible protection measures shall be cost efficient. You do not need to provide him with the most expensive measure while you can protect the witness with another cheaper measure;
- 6) The relationship of the protected person with other protected shall also be taken in to consideration;
- 7) Obligations and limitations imposed on the protected person according to law, if any; furthermore, the ministry may come up with other similar measures that it deemed is important.

Having this much about the eligibilities for witnesses and whistleblowers to be beneficiary of protection under both proclamations, the type of protection measure and the points needed to be

taken in to account while determining such protection under both proclamations it is now better to say a few points on the application for protection agreement.

3.4.4. Application protection measures

Somewhere in the paper I have stated that a witness or a whistleblower or their families to attain the status of protected person must enter in to protection agreement with the ministry.

3.4.5. Who is entitled to apply?

According to Art 6(1) of the witnesses and whistleblower's proclamation the person eligible for application is;

- 1) The witness or whistleblower himself or herself
- 2) In case of inability to apply, by investigator, a public prosecutor or any interested person on behalf of such person may apply.

In case of the anti-terrorism proclamation where the life, wellbeing of property of any person or his family is endangered for being a witness or whistleblower of terrorist crimes, Art 16(1) he shall be given protection in accordance with the Protection of Witnesses and Whistleblowers of Criminal Offences Proclamation No.699/2010.

Upon receiving of the application the ministry shall decide within 30 days. It may take urgent protection measures where it believes that grave danger is likely to occur to the life, physical security or property of the applicant until decision is given on the application.

3.4.6. Termination of protection agreement.

It is all about for how long a protection agreement shall last or stay in effect. Art 12 of the witnesses and whistleblowers proclamation governs this issue. A protection agreement shall terminate on the following grounds;

- a) Upon the expiry of the validity period fixed in the agreement;
- b) Upon the death of the protected person;
- c) Where the protected person voluntarily renounces the agreement;

3.5. Lack of established institution for criminal witness protection in Ethiopia

The lack of establishment of the criminal witness protection institution is a sign of the weak attitude of the government towards criminal witnesses in this regard

The protection provided to criminal witnesses in this way is considered a legal gap.

In other words, the lack of establishment of this institution indicates a lack of attention to the protection of criminal witnesses.

From here, it seems that the lack of an established institution is aimed at delaying the country's justice system. It also opens the way for criminal witnesses to be exposed to serious harm from perpetrators, psychological and physical harm, life, property and death

Therefore, as a solution what needs to be done is to establishing a very specialized institution aimed at closely the enforcement of a criminal witness protection institution to further strengthen the protection of criminal witnesses and judicial bodies at all levels, are expected to work with high levels of training and knowledge, as well as training institutes in the country has to give training on the subject matter so as to enhance knowledge of justice professionals; to ensure the pivotal role of witness protection services among society and give awareness on the existence of such right thereby encouraging witness or whistleblowers who afraid to testify about a crime and confidentiality and confidence such as judges, prosecutors, police and prison administration. etc.

3.6. Challenges facing to Ethiopian witness protection program.

People who witness crime, corruption and human right abuses play a crucial role in law enforcement efforts to bring the perpetrators in to justice. Often, however, we see being undermined this important role played by witnesses which is attributable to different reasons.

The law did not set out clear criteria for nominating for protection and determining the responsible party. The other one of the challenges that the Ethiopian witness protection program is facing can be related to capacity gaps, socio-cultural and economic challenges, level of financial investment by the national government to the witness protection program.

A shortage of human-resource skills and capacity to comprehensive protection of witnesses. All witness protection staff, including judges, prosecutors, prison officials and police should not carry out their duties to high standards of integrity, confidentiality and respect for human rights. Lack of extensive witness protection programs which help promote the confidence of witness in the cooperation with law enforcement agencies can also be taken as another challenge.

Awareness creation programs should have been prepared by the government. Failure to have a specialized organ which aims at overseeing the enforcement of the witness protection measures incorporated in the witness protection proclamation in addition to the human right commission.

CHAPTER FOUR

CONCLUDING REMARKS AND RECOMMENDATION

4.1. Conclusion

Cognizant of the pivotal role that witness plays in the dispensation of justice in general and the prosecution of criminals, who are serious threat to the public at large, in particular Ethiopia has come up with a law dealing with protection of witnesses. This proclamation provides a guarantee for the life, property and integrity of witnesses who testify the commission of serious crimes against any form of retaliation that may be forwarded against them. The witnesses and whistleblowers proclamation has provided a range of protection measures to be applied for witnesses who has given their testimony about the commission of certain criminal offences in which their application depends on circumstances.

The close examination of the Ethiopian witness protection law in general and the witness and whistleblowers proclamation in particular however, reveals that protection is accorded for limited witnesses who testify the commission of certain serious crimes. This, nonetheless, does not seem adequate to realize the intended level of cooperation required by witnesses. The objectives listed under the two proclamations discussed above to be fully realized there should not only be an extensive level of protection measures but also to be included numerous types of crimes so long as the one who testifies life or something is at serious threat. This limited protection does not also seem the spirit of the constitution which imposes duty up on all federal and state legislative, executive and judicial organs at all levels to respect and enforce this right to impart of every one of his or her knowledge, idea, and information of any kind which is found under the chapter three of the constitution.

4.2. Recommendations

From this what I recommend is;

The legislator to come up with witness protection law which gives protection even for witnesses who testify commission of crimes other than these under the proclamation so long as such testimony exposes that person in to serious threat of his life, property and bodily integrity and that of their families. As to me emphasis shall be given to the seriousness of the danger to which the witness is potentially to be exposed to

To equip well the witness protection authority materially, financially that help it put in to action the intended protection measures. Allocation of sufficient budget is indispensable for the actualization of the protection measures.

Establishing a very specialized agency aimed at closely overseeing the implementation of the witness and whistleblowers proclamation and the anti-terrorism proclamation and promoting awareness creation issues of such measures

Bibliography

Laws

- 1) Proclamation no.1/1995; a proclamation to pronounce the coming in to effect of the constitution of the federal democratic republic of Ethiopia.
- 2) Proclamation no.414/2004 the criminal code of the federal democratic republic of Ethiopia.
- 3) Proclamation no.699/2010, a proclamation to provide for the protection of witnesses and whistleblowers of criminal offences.
- 4) Proclamation no.1176/2010, the anti-terrorism proclamation.
- 5) The united nation convention against transitional and organized crime.
- 6) General assembly resolution 55/25
- 7) The United Nations convention against corruption.

Law on witness protection, un official translation incompliance with official gazette no.38/2005 courtesy of the OSCE mission to Skopje

Books

- 1) Wilson kiprono, kibetnegatich, wokabiMwangi, challenges facing the criminal justice system in relation to witness protection in Kenya.
- 2) Karen Kramer, witness protection as key tool in addressing serious and organized crime.
- 3) Antonio Maria costa, god practices for the protection of witnesses in criminal proceedings involving organized crime, 2008, p 8 ff.
- 4) Koren Elaine (2014), research number, 43, witness programs in selected countries.
- 5) Webster third new international dictionary, page 2627
- 6) Black's law dictionary, 8th editio

